Cost-benefit analysis – Murrumbateman Playground

### Evaluation of potential sites for a Category 1 Playground in Murrumbateman as described in the 2017 YVC Park & Playground Strategy (the Strategy). This document has been prepared by the Murrumbateman Progress Association (MPA) Recreational Facilities Working Group with reference to the NSW Everyone Can Play Guidelines (Can I get there, Can I play, Can I Stay) and the following key considerations as per the Strategy. MPA notes that alongside this document further community input and consultation will be required to ultimately determine the final location and playground design. This document is designed to help guide those community discussions.

Category 1 Playground requirements – according to strategy:

1. Toilets
2. Bubblers
3. Lighting
4. Pathways
5. Accessibility for wheelchairs
6. Large playground unit
7. Multiple pieces of equipment to cater for diverse age ranges
8. Softfall attenuation area to 250sqm
9. Table & seating

Considerations for siting playgrounds

1. Ease of access for all users from surrounding entrance points
2. Location in relation to public amenities
3. Views to all areas of the park and natural surveillance from surrounding areas; and
4. Suitable distance from potential hazards such as roads or waterways, where possible
5. Accessibility of shade

| Potential Sites | Ease of access | Close to public amenities | Natural surveillance | Distance from potential hazards | Shade | Value for money | Sufficient Space | Pros | Cons | Conclusion |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Hawthorn** | Low | Low | Low | Good (depending on exact location) | Unclear | No  However, level ground which may reduce construction costs | Yes | * Council owned land * Large Space * Co-locate with future High School * Co-locate with future recreation * Potentially greater water security | * Undeveloped * Long timeframe * Additional costs of developing infrastructure (greenfields site) * No sewerage, town water, electricity infrastructure * Toilets required to be constructed * Road required to be constructed * Excessive cost to provide facilities associated with Category 1 playground that meets all-accessible requirements | **NOT RECOMMENDED**  The costs associated with making this greenfields site suitable for a playground in terms of access, amenities, utility connections mean that it will not afford value for money and will likely cost more than available funding which puts project delivery at risk.  It is noted that there is sufficient space to meet the minimum size for a centralised park (2Ha)  Could be flagged for future recreation and an additional park as population growth warrants. |
| **Recreation Grounds**  Several possible locations available:   * Adjacent to Tennis Courts * Southern arena * Horse yards | High | High | High | Good | Yes  Some mature trees | Yes  Level ground which may reduce construction costs | Yes  Space to meet the minimum size for a centralised park (4000sqm as part of multiuse) | * Centrally located * High tourism destination * Already council owned land and managed * A couple of potential sites to choose from * Great access (two entry points Murrumbateman Road and Barton Highway) * Parking * Existing shade (established trees) * Co-located with existing community facilities and activities * Existing toilets * Existing bore water * Town water expected with new Amenities building * Existing picnic tables * Potential for additional facilities to be constructed e.g. barbeques that would have multi-use * Existing bike path * Wheelchair access * Near the shops * Potential for coffee/food van to operate on site * Increased return on investment by multiplying use by user groups * Sustainability * Existing maintenance plan * Space to meet the minimum size for a centralised park (4000sqm as part of multiuse) | * Equestrian facilities are currently using existing sites (although it is agreed that these will be moved to centralise all equestrian facilities in the Northern area of Rec Grounds) * Need to consider effect on significant community events in terms of space e.g. Field Days * Need to cross road (Barton Highway) to get to shops | **RECOMMENDED**  The Recreation Grounds hosts the majority of community, sporting and recreational events including the popular markets. It has existing public facilities including public toilets and a community hall. It is soon to have a changeroom/ amenities building. The Grounds has centralised open spaces and facilities and is a hub for the community. Co-locating the playground with other recreational facilities in Murrumbateman supports both physical development and social growth within the community.  This location provides exceptional value for money in avoiding the additional costs of constructing public toilets. This location also has potential to secure additional grants for future playground improvements given its proximity to the core of the village and tourism sites.  The key considerations in the NSW Everyone can play guidelines are - Can I get there? Can I play? Can I Stay? This location is the only site in Murrumbateman that currently meets all of these requirements and meets the needs of the community. |
| **Old Schoolhouse Grounds** | Medium | Medium  Note: road safety concerns | Medium | Poor  Road proximity a significant concern | No | No | No  Space does not meet the minimum size for a centralised park (2Ha) | * Centrally located * Crown land – Council to become land manager * High tourism potential * Close to School * Some accessibility through footpaths * Sewerage and town water infrastructure is available nearby but facilities would need to be built * Near the shops | * Toilets required to be constructed * Exacerbate road safety issue with people transiting from community activities from Rec Ground (e.g. dance lessons at Rec Grounds or Little Athletics where parents have to entertain younger children) * Access issues competing with school traffic, parking will inevitable be used for school pick up and drop off. * Road safety * Limited parking * Potential road safety issue due to parking overflow at Jones Park * Additional traffic entering Barton Highway (potential safety issue) * No water facilities * Additional pathways required on Rose St * No night lighting? * Space does not meet the minimum size for a centralised park (2Ha) | **NOT RECOMMENDED**  While this site would be centrally located within the village it has serious road safety concerns given the existing public toilets are only accessible by crossing the highway (and there is no pedestrian crossing).  Space at this location is limited by the school, heritage buildings and orchard, and private property. It would be difficult to construct appropriate parking and so overflow parking would be Jones Park which is again across the highway.  The space at this site is also constrained by the heritage buildings and it would be difficult for the community to expand with future projects to install additional recreational facilities e.g. BBQs or community meeting spaces. Development needs to be complementary and sensitive to its historic values.  Most sporting activities take place at the Recreation Grounds and so this location will encourage significant pedestrian traffic across the highway as parents entertain young children while older children participate in sporting activities. |
| **The Common** | Low | Low | Low | Good | Medium | No  Level ground which may reduce construction costs | Yes | * Space * Undeveloped * Council owned land * Existing established trees | * Access * No sewerage infrastructure (not even to boundary) * No water infrastructure * Isolated - safety concerns * Not central - Away from main street areas - not a tourism destination area * Residential impacts e.g. noise pollution * No parking * No pathways on existing roads * No night lighting * No facilities infrastructure | **NOT RECOMMENDED**  Significant costs would be involved in ensuring appropriate access, pathways. parking and utilities infrastructure on a greenfields site.  Impact on immediate residential neighbours surrounding the area.  Safety concerns given lack of natural surveillance |
| **Police Blocks**  **Rose St/South St/East St (Barton Highway)** | No | No | Yes | Poor  Road proximity a significant concern | No | No | Yes | * Centrally located * High tourism potential * Near the shops | * Reserved for public buildings (crown land use) * Sewerage and towns water infrastucture nearby * No facilities   - No pathways | **NOT RECOMMENDED**  Not within existing use for Crown Land, significant expense as no utilities connected.  Road Safety issues |